

Climate changes caused by degassing of sediments during the emplacement of large igneous provinces: REPLY

Clément Ganino

Université Nice – Sophia Antipolis, CNRS/ IRD, Observatoire de la Côte d'Azur, Laboratoire Géoazur

Nicholas T. Arndt

Laboratoire de Géodynamique des Chaînes Alpines, Université Joseph Fourier de Grenoble, CNRS

Geology 2010, v. 38, p. e211, doi:10.1130/G31071Y.1

We are grateful to Grzegorz Racki for his comment on our manuscript and for his overall support for the hypothesis that the nature of the rocks in the substrate of large igneous province has an important influence on their environmental impact (Ganino and Arndt, 2009). His principle reservation is that we have oversimplified the situation and have failed to take into account other contributing factors. To a large extent we agree entirely with him: a large number of different processes come into play during the emplacement of an enormous volume of hot magma into heterogeneous crustal rocks, and any attempt to quantify rigorously the total impact must take all of these into account. Indeed, in addition to the factors that he discusses, variations in magma flux through the duration of the eruption (Chenet et al. 2008), and variations in sea-level, the composition and temperature of the atmosphere, and the configuration of the continents may enhance or mitigate the impact of the eruptions. In a four-page *Geology* paper it is impossible to discuss such processes in any detail but we are continuing our studies of aureoles and will treat many of the factors that Grzegorz Racki raises in a forthcoming publication.

In response to his specific points:

1. *Eruptive gas content of basaltic magma*. It is true that basaltic magma contains magmatic gas, including CO₂, SO₂ and halogens, that will be liberated on eruption (Self et al., 2006). But given that the composition of the dominant tholeiitic basalts are similar in every continental province (e.g. Bryan and Ernst, 2008), the contribution of magmatic gases will be similar in each case and their volume will depend mostly on the volume of emitted magma. The very different environmental impact from province to province without correlation with the emitted volume of magma made us propose another cause.

2. *LIP-associated explosive volcanism*. It is true that explosive alkaline magmas, or felsic pyroclastic rocks will emit a greater proportion of magmatic gas than gas-poor tholeiitic basalt, but in most provinces the proportion of such rocks is small compared to that of the tholeiites (Bryan and Ernst, 2008). In addition some provinces with an unusually large proportion of alkaline lavas or felsic ignimbrites have had only a minimal environmental impact. Two notable examples are the Ethiopian (e.g. Keiffer et al. 2004) and Karoo provinces (Erlank, 1984).

3. *Oceanographic consequences of high-latitude volcanism*. The enhanced circulation in the atmosphere of volcanic emissions at high latitudes are well known and these no doubt

contributed to the impact of Siberian flood volcanism (Racki and Wignall, 2005). We are grateful to Grzegorz Racki for additional consequences of eruption at high latitudes. Yet we, like many other authors maintain that the devastating consequences of the Siberian eruption were mainly the result of liberation of toxic gases from contact aureoles in the hydrocarbon-bearing carbonates and evaporates of the sedimentary basin beneath this province (Retallack and Jahren, 2008 ; Svensen et al. 2008).

To conclude, we agree with Grzegorz Racki that the contribution of each of these factors must be taken into account and that the case history of LIP emplacement should be treated on a case-by-case basis.

References cited

Bryan, S.E., and Ernst, R.E., 2008, Revised definition of Large Igneous Provinces (LIPs): *Earth-Science Reviews*, v. 86, p. 175-202, doi: 10.1016/j.earscirev.2007.08.008.

Chenet, A.-L., Courtillot, V., Fluteau, F., Gérard, M., Quidelleur, X., Khadri, S.F.R., Subbarao, K.V., and Thordarson T., 2008, Determination of rapid Deccan eruptions across the Cretaceous-Tertiary boundary using paleomagnetic secular variation: 2. Constraints from analysis of eight new sections and synthesis for a 3500-m-thick composite section: *Journal of Geophysical Research*, v. 114, B06103, doi:10.1029/2008JB005644.

Erlank, A.J., 1984, Petrogenesis of the Volcanic Rocks of the Karoo Province: *The Geological Society of South Africa, Special Publication*, v.13, 395 pages

Ganino, C., and Arndt, N.T., 2009, Climate changes caused by degassing of sediments during the emplacement of large igneous provinces: *Geology*, v. 37, p. 323–326, doi: 10.1130/G25325A.1.

Kieffer, B., Arndt, N.T., Lapierre, H., Bastien, F., Bosch, D., Pecher, A., Yirgu, G., Ayalew, D., Weis, D., Jerram, D.A., Keller, F., Meugniot, C., 2004, The Transition from Plateau to Shield Volcanism in Ethiopia: a petrological and geochemical study: *Journal of Petrology*, v. 45, p. 793-834, doi:10.1093/petrology/egg112.

Racki, G., and Wignall, P.B., 2005, Late Permian double-phased mass extinction and volcanism: An oceanographic perspective, in Over, D.J., Morrow, J.R. and Wignall, P.B. eds., *Understanding Late Devonian and Permian–Triassic Biotic and Climatic Events: Towards an Integrated Approach*, *Developments in Palaeontology and Stratigraphy*: Amsterdam, Elsevier, v. 20, p. 263–297.

Retallack, G.J., and Jahren, A.H., 2008, Methane release from igneous intrusion of coal during late Permian extinction events: *The Journal of Geology* v. 116, p. 1-20, doi: 10.1086/524120.

Self, S., Widdowson, M., Thordarson, T., and Jay, A.E., 2006, Volatile fluxes during flood basalt eruptions and potential effects on the global environment: A Deccan perspective: *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, v. 248, p. 518-532, doi: 10.1016/j.epsl.2006.05.041.

Svensen, H., Planke, S., Polozov, A.G., Schmidbauer, N., Corfu, F., Podladchikov, Y.Y., and Jamtveit, B., 2009, Siberian gas venting and the end-Permian environmental crisis: *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, v. 277, p. 490-500, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2008.11.015